Clean Energy Potential in OTC and Reasonable Level of Commitment for 2007 SIPs

Presented by Art Diem, USEPA OTC HEDD Meeting, 2/1/2007



Clean EnergyEnvironment STATE PARTNERSHIP





Outline

EPA Guidance

- Voluntary and Emerging Measures
- EE/RE Quantification Guidance
- >Bundled Measures Policy
- How Clean Energy Programs can meet these guidance
- One set of NOx estimates from IPM TRUM analysis







EPA Guidance: Emerging and Voluntary Measures Policy

- "Incorporating Emerging and Voluntary Measures in a State Implementation Plan, 9/04
 - http://www.epa.gov/ttn/oarpg/t1/meta/m8507.html
 - Allows up to 6% of emission reductions to be satisfied by Emerging and Voluntary Measures
 - Emerging Measure = an emission reduction strategy that hasn't been traditionally quantified
 - Voluntary Measure = not "enforceable"
 - An individual measure can be either or both emerging and voluntary



- Guidance on State Implementation Plan for Emission Reductions from Electric-Sector Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy Measures, 8/2004
 - ➤4 steps for quantification
 - Statements regarding criteria: Enforceable, quantifiable, surplus, permanent



Quantification Steps:

- 1. Estimate the energy savings or amount of energy generation that will be displaced
- 2. Convert the energy impact of a project or initiative into an estimated emissions reduction
- 3. Determine the impact from the estimated emission reduction on air quality in the non-attainment area (can be based on other efforts/studies etc).
- 4. Provide a mechanism to validate or evaluate the effectiveness of the project or measure.



Quantifiable:

- "Emerging" measure flexibility
 - estimate and measure energy savings, and apply appropriate emission reduction factor

Surplus:

- Surplus to SIP Baseline and surplus to CAIR
- Allowance retirement to ensure that the emission reductions due to clean energy (that is, reduced generation from CAIR affected units) are surplus
 Or
- Demonstration that reductions would happen without allowance retirement:
 - p.10 "Another way is to clearly demonstrate that emissions decrease in the area despite the cap and trade program and the ability for plants to sell more electricity to other areas. This demonstration will likely entail a detailed analysis of electricity dispatch and allowance markets to determine the specific impact of the measures on the system."

Permanent:

Sustained level of activity during the SIP time period and the foreseeable future



- Enforceable (see p. 13 of document):
 - > (1) Enforceable directly against a source;
 - (2) Enforceable against another party responsible for the energy efficiency or renewable energy activity; or
 - > (3) Included as a voluntary measure

"If the reductions are "enforceable against another party responsible for the energy efficiency or renewable energy activity", then they are considered enforceable if:

- (a) The activity or measure is independently verifiable;
- (b) Violations are defined;
- (c) Those liable for violations can be identified;
- (d) You and EPA maintain the ability to apply penalties and secure appropriate corrective actions where applicable;
- (e) Citizens have access to all the required activity information from the responsible party;
- (f) Citizens can file suits against the responsible party for violations; and
- (g) The activity or measure is practicably enforceable in accordance with EPA guidance on practicable enforceability."



Modeled TRUM NOx Reductions



TRUM

- TRUM = The Technology Retrofit and Updating Model (TRUM)
 - Macro-driven spreadsheet model, developed by ICF to supplement the use of its Integrated Planning Model (IPM).
 - Uses a linear programming formulation to select investment options and to dispatch generation and load management resources to meet overall electricity demand and energy requirements (Load duration curve)
 - > More simple and streamlined compared to IPM.
 - Runs quickly but does not provide exact solutions.



TRUM Inputs

- Modeling performed by the Clean Air Markets Division
- Started with 2010 CAIR scenario as a base case
- Reconfigured the modeling exercise to look at episodic period (twelve high electric demand days (based on recent load projected to 2010)
- Included smaller units not subject to cap and trade programs

Table of Contents 1. Uses of the Technology Retrofit and Updating Model 1 2. Modeling Approach a Single Iteration 1 3. Cencoptul Approach a Single Iteration 1 3.1. Determination of Marginal Cerb y Unit. 3 3.2. Reading of Unit. 3 3.3. Determination of Capacity Factors. 3 3.4. Establishment of Reverse by Segment. 4 3.5. Establishment of Reverse by Segment. 4 3.6. Determination of Sevense by Segment. 4 3.6. Determination of Sevense by Segment. 5 4.1. Celectricons in a Single Instrion. 5 4.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.2. Retrofit Choices. 6 4.1.3. Combinations of Timel Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.2.2. NOVE Emissions. 7 4.1.2.2. Nove Emissions. 7 4.1.2.2. Retrofit Choices. 8 4.1.2.3. Carbinations of Final Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.2.1. Sology Emissions. 7 4.1.2.2. Rotopic Cost in TomoMUb. 7	Table of Contents of the Technology Retrofit and Updating Model 1 aling Approach 1 optual Approach to a Single Tecration 2 Determination of Marginal Cost by Unit. 3 Runking of Understand Streams 3 Determination of Capsured. 3 Determination of Streams by Segment. 4 Determination of Portority by
1. Uses of the Technology Retrofit and Updating Model 1 2. Moleling Approach to a Single Iteration 2 3.1. Determination of Marginal Corb by Unit 3 3.2. Ranking of Units 3 3.3. Determination of Capacity Factors. 3 3.4. Establishment of Reverse by Segment. 4 3.5. Establishment of Reverse by Segment. 4 3.6. Determination of Capacity Factors. 4 3.7. Establishment of Reverse by Segment. 4 3.6. Determination of Politikity. 5 4.1. Calculationes in a Single Instition. 5 4.1. Calculations in a Single Institute. 5 4.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.2. Relations of The Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.3. Combinations of The Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.2.1. Socializations of The Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.2.2. NOVE Emissions. 7 4.1.2.3. Carbinations of The Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.2.4. Hg Emissions. 7 4.1.2.5. Carbinations. 7 4.1.2.6. Hg Emissions. 7 4.1.2.8. Algoin Control Cost in SIMUE. 8 4.1.3.1. Fual Cost. 8 <t< th=""><th>of the Technology Retrofit and Updating Model</th></t<>	of the Technology Retrofit and Updating Model
2. Modeling Approach 1 2. Conceptual Approach to a Single Iteration 1 3. Conceptual Approach to a Single Iteration 2 3.1. Determination of Marginal Cost by Unit 3 3.2. Ranking of Unit. 3 3.3. Determination of Capacity Factors. 3 3.4. Establishment of Proceed by Segment. 4 3.5. Determination of Profinability. 5 4.1. Calculations of Revenues by Segment. 4 3.6. Determination of Profinability. 5 4.1. Calculations in a Single Iteration. 5 4.1.1. Calculations in a Single Iteration. 5 4.1.1. Lactor Considered for a Unit. 5 4.1.1. Lactor Choices. 5 4.1.1. Lactor Choices. 5 4.1.1. Lactor Choices. 6 4.1.1. Lactor Choices. 7 4.1.2. Calculation of Emissions in Tous/MWh. 7 4.1.2. SCOL Emissions. 7 4.1.2. Columinations of Visible Cost in S/MWh. 7 4.1.2. Chore Emissions. 7 4.1.2. Columinations of Visible Cost in S/MWh. 8 4.1.3. Hege Cost. 9 <th>aling Approach</th>	aling Approach
3. Cenceptul Approach to a Single Instanton. 2 3.1. Determination of Murginal Cost by Unit. 3 3.2. Ranking of Unit. 3 3.3. Determination of Copacity Factors. 3 3.4. Establishment of Neurons by Sagment. 4 3.5. Establishment of Neurons by Sagment. 4 3.6. Determination of Profitability. 5 4.1. Calculations of Procomptal Approach 5 4.1.1. La Colocies Considered for a Unit. 5 4.1.1.2. Ratofit Colocies. 5 4.1.1.2. Ratofit Colocies. 6 4.1.1.3. Combinations of Fluid Types and Ratofits. 6 4.1.1.4. Existing Ratofits. 6 4.1.2. Statofit Colocies. 7 4.1.2. Statofit Colocies. 8 4.1.2. St	capital Approach to a Single Textion 2 Determinition of Marginal Cost by Unit. 3 Runking of Units 3 Determinition of Capacity Factors. 3 Establishment of Prices by Segment. 4 Determinition of Profession by Segment. 4 Determinition of Professions. 5
3.1. Deterministics of Marginal Cest by Unit. 3 3.2. Ranking of Unit. 3 3.3. Deterministics of Capacity Factors. 3 3.4. Establishment of Florever by Segment. 4 3.5. Establishment of Reverse by Segment. 4 3.6. Deterministics of Segment. 5 4.1. Celections in a Single Instrict. 5 4.1. Celections in a Single Instrict. 5 4.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.2. Restrict A Choices. 5 4.1.3. Combinations of Fuel Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.2. Nove Emissions. 7 4.1.2. Nove Emissions. 7 4.1.2. Nove Emissions. 7 4.1.2. Celocations of Fuel Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.2. Celocations of Emissions. 7 4.1.2. Nove Emissions. 7 4.1.2. Celocations of Emissions. 7 4.1.2. So Thermissions. 7 4.1.2. So Thermissions. 7 4.1.2. So Thermission	Determination of Marginal Cost by Unit
3.1. Determination of Copacity Factors. 3 3.3. Determination of Proceed by Segment. 3 3.4. Establishment of Neurons by Segment. 4 3.6. Determination of Profibability. 5 4.1. Determination of Profibability. 5 4.1. Calculations of the Conceptual Approach. 5 4.1. Calculations of the Conceptual Approach. 5 4.1.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.1.2. Ratcoff. Choices. 6 4.1.1.3. Combinations of Fuel Types and Ratrofits. 6 4.1.1.4. Existing Ratcoffst. 6 4.1.1.2. Ratcoff. Choices. 7 4.1.2. Calculation of Emissions in Tous/MWh. 7 4.1.2. SO2 Emissions. 7 4.1.2. SO2 Emissions. 7 4.1.2. SO2 Emissions. 7 4.1.2. SC Vox Emissions. 7 4.1.2. SC Hg Emissions. 7 4.1.2. S Hg Emissions. 7 4.1.3.1. Fuel Cost. 8 4.1.3.2. Variable OceM Cost. 9 4.1.3.3. Ratorfit Variable OceM Cost. 9 4.1.3.4. Allowance Cost. 9 4.1.4. Allowanco	Knaining of Units 5 Determinition of Cepacity Factors. 3 Establishment of Prices by Segment. 4 Establishment of Professibly
3.5. Letteriumation of Classicity Factoria. 3 3.4. Establishment of Floreic by Segment. 4 3.5. Determination of Policity Segment. 4 3.6. Determination of Revense by Segment. 4 3.6. Determination of Revense by Segment. 5 4.1. Calculations in a Single Instition. 5 4.1. Calculations in a Single Instition. 5 4.1.1. Fuel Choices 5 4.1.1. Tail Choices. 5 4.1.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.2. Calculations of Final Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.3. Combinations of Final Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.2. Solutinition of Trainisions. 7 4.1.2.1. Solutinition of Trainisions. 7 4.1.2.1. Solutinition of Trainisions. 7 4.1.2.3. Columinations. 7 4.1.2.4. Hg Eminisions. 7 4.1.2.5. Choon Eministons. 7 4.1.2.6. Hg Eminisions. 7 4.1.3. Devention of Visible Costs in SMWb. 8 4.1.3. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.1. Survision Outble Cost. 9 4.13.1. Survision Outble Cost. 9 4.13.1. Survision Outble Cost. 9 <tr< td=""><td>Determination of Legislity Factors</td></tr<>	Determination of Legislity Factors
3.5. Extrolutionation of Profession by Segment. 4 3.6. Extrolutionation of Profession by Segment. 4 3.6. Extrolutionation of Profession by Segment. 5 4.10. Deterministion of Profession by Segment. 5 4.11. Calculations in a Single Instruction. 5 4.11. Colore Considered for a Unit. 5 4.11.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.11.2. Ratoffic Choices. 6 4.11.3. Combinations of Pall Types and Ratrofin. 6 4.11.4. Existing Ratrofits. 6 4.11.2. Sold Emissions. 7 4.12. Sold Emissions. 7 4.13. Sold Emissions. 7 4.13. Sold Emissions. 8 4.13. Fuel Cost. 8 4.13. Fuel Cost. 9 <t< td=""><td>Establishment of Proceedings of Segment. 4 Establishment of Revenue by Segment. 4 Determination of Profitability. 5</td></t<>	Establishment of Proceedings of Segment. 4 Establishment of Revenue by Segment. 4 Determination of Profitability. 5
3.6. Determinantics of Profinability. 5 4. Emplementation of the Screenful Approx. 5 4.1. Columbiantics of the Screenful Approx. 5 4.1. Columbiantics of the Screenful Approx. 5 4.1. Li Columbiantics. 5 4.1. Li Retroff Choires. 5 4.1. Li Retroff Choires. 5 4.1. Li Retroff Choires. 6 4.1. Combinations of Fuel Types and Retroffs. 7 4.1. Combinations of Tool Cost of Statist. 8 4.1. Columbiant of Variable Cost. 8 4.1.3. Tool Cost.<	Determination of Profitability
4. Implementation of the Conceptual Approach. 5 4.1. Colorison in a Single Brantion. 5 4.1.1. Choices Considered for a Unit. 5 4.1.1.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.1.2. Rateoff: Colorise. 5 4.1.1.3. Conductions of Fuel Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.1.4. Existing Extendits. 6 4.1.1.5. Calculations of Fuel Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.1.2. Colorismicons. 7 4.1.2.1. SO2 Emissions. 7 4.1.2.1. SO2 Emissions. 7 4.1.2.2. NOVE Emissions. 7 4.1.2.3. Carbon Emissions. 7 4.1.2.4. Hg Emissions. 7 4.1.2.5. Hg Emissions Without CL 8 4.1.3.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.1.3.2. Vurisble OxM Cost. 9 4.1.3.3. Ratoff Vurisble OxM Cost. 9 4.1.3.4. Allowance Cost. 9 4.1.4. Contration of Frate Gast. 9	Contraction of the Construct American
4.1 Colculations in a Single Tearston 5 4.11. Colocae Considered for a Unit. 5 4.11.1 Fuel Choices. 5 4.11.2 Retroft Choices. 6 4.11.3 Combinations of Fuel Types and Ratrofts. 6 4.11.4 Existing Retrofts. 6 4.12 Calculation of Emissions in Tean MUVb. 7 4.12.1 SO2 Emissions 7 4.12.2 NOX Emissions 7 4.12.3 Curbon Emissions 7 4.12.4 Hg Emissions 7 4.12.5 Hg Emissions 8 4.12.6 Hg Emissions 8 4.13.1 Fuel Colt. 8 4.13.2 Norbit Mixton 7 4.13.3 Retrofts 9 4.13.4 Allowman Colt. 9 4.13.5 Present Value of Inter Allowmances. 9 4.13.6 Present Value of Tentre Allowmances. 9 4.13.7 Present Value of Tentre Allowmances. 9 4.14. Colonimon of Total Cost on Cont. 10 4.15.0 Present Value of Tentre Allowmances. 9 4.14.4 Colonimon of Total Cost on Cont. 10 4.15.0 Present Value of Tentre Allowmances. 10	ementation of the Conceptual Approach
4.1.1 Coocies Considered for a Unit. 5 4.1.1.1 Fuel Choices. 5 4.1.1.2 Retrofit Choices. 6 4.1.1.3 Combinations of Fuel Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.1.4 Existing Retrofits. 6 4.1.1.5 Combinations of Fuel Types and Retrofits. 6 4.1.1.4 Existing Retrofits. 6 4.1.2 Colombion of Trainsions in TownMVB. 7 4.1.2.1 SO2 Trainsions. 7 4.1.2.2 Curbon Emissions. 7 4.1.2.3 Curbon Emissions. 7 4.1.2.4 Hg Emissions Without CL 8 4.1.2.5 Hg Emissions With CL 8 4.1.3.1 Fuel Cost. 9 4.1.3.2 Variable OabM Cost. 9 4.1.3.3 Retrofit Variable OabM Cost. 9 4.1.3.4 Allowance Cost. 9 4.1.3.5 Present Value of Future Allowances. 9 4.1.4 Allowance Cost. 9 4.1.4 Allowance Cost. 9 4.1.4 Constraintion of Future Clowances. 9 4.1.4 Constraintion of Future Clowances. 9 4.1.3.5 Present Value of Future Slowances. 9 4.1.4 Constraintion of Future Clowances. 9 4.1.4 Con	Calculations in a Single Iteration
4.11.1. Fuel Choices. 5 4.11.2. Retofic Choices. 6 4.11.3. Combinations of Fuel Types and Retrofits. 6 4.11.4. Existing Retofits. 6 4.12. Calculation of Emissions in TouroNUW. 7 4.12. SO2 Emissions 7 4.12. SO2 Emissions 7 4.12. SO2 Emissions 7 4.12. SC Trainsions 7 4.12. SC Trainsions 7 4.12. Step Emissions 7 4.12.5. Hg Emissions Without CI. 8 4.12.6. Hg Emissions Without CI. 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.2. Vuriable Or&M Cost. 9 4.13.3. Retofic Vuriable Or&M Cost. 9 4.13.4. Allowance Cost. 9 4.13.5. Present Value of Future Allowances. 9 4.14. Colculation of Fixed Cost. 9 4.15. Present Value of Future Caracter. 9 4.14. Colculation of Fixed Cost. 10 4.15. Present Value of Factofits. 10 4.14. Colculation of Fixed Cost. 10 4.15. Present Value of Factofits. 10 4.15. Obornination of Approxinumus Caractity Factor and Profit.	4.1.1. Choices Considered for a Unit
4.11.2. Retrofit Choices 6 4.11.3. Combinations of Final Types and Retrofits 6 4.11.4. Existing Ratrofits 6 4.11.4. Existing Ratrofits 6 4.12.1.5002 Emissions 7 4.12.2.1.5002 Emissions 7 4.12.3. Curbon Emissions 7 4.12.3. Curbon Emissions 7 4.12.3. Fig. Emissions 7 4.12.4. Hg Emissions 7 4.12.5. Hg Emissions 7 4.12.6. Hg Emissions 7 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.3. Retrofit Variable Oxth Cost. 9 4.13.4. Allownee Cost. 9 4.13.5. Present Value Cost. 9 4.13.6. Colluting of Fuel Cost of Retrofits. 10 4.13.5. Desemination of Approximate Copacity Factor and Profit. 10	4.1.1.1. Fuel Choices
+ 1.1.3. Combinations of Fuel Types and Subtrim. 6 + 1.1.4. Existing Readoffs. 6 + 1.2. Calculation of Emissions. 7 + 1.2.1. SO2 Emissions. 7 + 1.2.2. NOX Emissions. 7 + 1.2.3. Curbon Emissions. 7 + 1.2.4. Hg Emissions. 7 + 1.2.5. Hg Emissions Without CI. 8 + 1.2.6. Hg Emissions Without CI. 8 + 1.2.6. Hg Emissions Without CI. 8 + 1.3.1. Fuel Cost. 9 + 1.3.3. Ratrofit Variable Orbit Cost. 9 + 1.3.4. Allowance Cost. 9 + 1.3.5. Presear Value of Fuere Allowances. 9 + 1.3.4. Allowance Cost. 9 + 1.3.5. Presear Cost. 9 + 1.4. Colculation of Fuel Costs of Ratofits. 10 + 1.4. Colculation of Paroscins. 10	4.1.1.2. Retrofit Choices
+1.1+. Extraing factorizations 5 4.12 Columno of Emissions 7 4.12 I SO2 Emissions 7 4.12 I SO2 Emissions 7 4.12 I SO2 Emissions 7 4.12 I Solution of Emissions 7 4.12 I Solution Emissions 7 4.12 I Solution Emissions 7 4.12 I Solution Emissions 7 4.13 I Solutions Without CI 8 4.13 Deterministic OVisible Costs in SMWb. 8 4.13 I Fuel Cost 8 4.13 I Fuel Cost 9 4.13 A Ratorit Visible Oth Cost. 9 4.13 J. Fuel Cost Visible Cost in SMWb. 8 4.13 I. Fuel Cost A Cost. 9 4.13 J. Deversition of A Cost. 9 4.13 J. Deversition of Ratority. 9 4.14 Colculation of Fixed Costs of Ratority. 10 4.15 Operministics of A Representing Cogarity Feature and Profit. 10	4.1.1.5. Combinations of Fuel Types and Ketrofits
4121 SO2 Emission 7 4121 SO2 Emission 7 4122 NON Emission 7 4123 Cubon Emission 7 4124 Ig Emission 7 4125 Tob Emission 7 4124 Ig Emission 7 4125 Ig Emission 7 4126 Ig Emission 8 413.0 Read Color 8 413.1 Fuel Cost 8 413.3 Refort Variable O&M Cost 9 413.4 Allowance Cost 9 413.5 Present Value Orthure Allowances 9 413.4 Allowance Cost 9 413.5 Present Value of Cost of Emerofit 10 414 Cost of Emerofit 10 415 Present Value of Cost of Emerofit 10	4.1.2. Calculation of Enviroinne in Teach/IIIb. 7
4.12.2. NON Emission 7 4.12.2. NON Emission 7 4.12.4. Hg Emission 8 4.12.5. Hg Emissions Wifter CI. 8 4.12.6. Hg Emissions Wifter CI. 8 4.12.6. Hg Emissions Wifter CI. 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.2. Variable OebM Cost. 9 4.13.3. Retrofit Variable OebM Cost. 9 4.13.3. Present Variable OebM Cost. 9 4.13.3. Present Variable Origination of Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.3. Present Variable Origination of Fuel Cost. 9 4.14. Colculation of Fuel Cost. 9 4.15. Present Value of Pathere Allowances. 9 4.14. Colculation of Fuel Cost. 10 4.15. Description Cost. 10	4121 SO2 Emissions 7
4.12.3. Carbon Emissions. 7 4.12.4. Hg Emissions. 8 4.12.5. Hg Emissions. Without CI. 8 4.12.6. Hg Emissions. With CI. 8 4.12.6. Hg Emissions. With CI. 8 4.13.6. Hug Emissions. With CI. 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.2. Variable OktM Cost. 9 4.13.3. Retrofit Variable OktM Cost. 9 4.13.4. Allownees: Cost. 9 4.13.5. Present Value Of Entre Allownees. 9 4.13.5. Desemination of Approximate Capacity Factor and Profit. 10 4.15. Desemination of Approximate Capacity Factor and Profit. 10	4.1.2.2. NOx Emissions
4.12.4. Hg Emission 8 4.12.5. Hg Emissions Write CI. 8 4.12.6. Hg Emissions Write CI. 8 4.12.6. Hg Emissions Write CI. 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.2. Variable Oct M Cost. 9 4.13.3. Rarofit Variable Oct M Cost. 9 4.13.4. Allowance Cost. 9 4.13.5. Present Value of Functors Rarofits. 9 4.14. Colculation of Fixed Cost. 9 4.14. Colculation of Fixed Cost. 9 4.13.5. Present Value of Functors Rarofits. 10 4.14. Colculation of Fixed Cost. 9	4.1.2.3. Carbon Emissions
4.12.5. Hg Emissions Without CL 8 4.12.6. Hg Emissions With CL 8 4.13. Detarminition of Variable Cests in S/MWh 8 4.13.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.2. Variable O&M Cost. 9 4.13.3. Reatofit Variable O&M Cost. 9 4.13.4. Allowance Cost. 9 4.13.4. Allowance Cost. 9 4.13.5. Present Value OF Intere Allowances. 9 4.13.6. Inclustion of Functe Cost. 10 4.15. Detarmination of Approximate Capacity Factor and Profit. 10	4.1.2.4. Hg Emissions
4.12.6 Hg Emersions With CL 8 4.13 Deterministics of Visible Costs in SMWb. 8 4.13.1 Fuel Cost. 9 4.13.2 Variable OctM Cost. 9 4.13.3 Retrofit Variable OctM Cost. 9 4.13.4 Allowance Cost. 9 4.13.5 Present Value of Future Allowances. 9 4.13.5 Present Value Cost of Retrofits. 10 4.1 Determination of Approximate Copacity Factor and Profit. 10	4.1.2.5. Hg Emissions Without CI
4.1.3. Determination of Versible Costs in SMMin. 8 4.1.3.1. Fuel Cost. 9 4.1.3.2. Variable 0&M Cost. 9 4.1.3.3. Ratrofit Variable 0&M Cost. 9 4.1.3.4. Allowance Cost 9 4.1.3.5. Present Value 0 & Monte Allowances 9 4.1.3.6. Insteam Value 0 Costs of Ratrofits 9 4.1.3.7. Descent Value of Pattere Allowances 9 4.1.3.9. Descent Value 0 Costs of Ratrofits 10 4.1.5. Deterministic of Agreenisms Capacity Factor and Profit 10 4.1.5. Deterministics of Agreenisms Capacity Factor and Profit 10	4.1.2.6. Hg Emissions With CI
+ 1.5.1. Fusi Cost. 9 + 1.3.2. Variable OddM Cost. 9 + 1.3.3. Ratrofit Variable OddM Cost. 9 + 1.3.4. Allowance Cost. 9 + 1.3.5. Present Value of Future Allowances 9 + 1.3.6. Instead Cost of Remoting 9 + 1.4. Collution of Future Allowances 9 + 1.4. Collution of Future Cost of Remoting 10 + 1.5. Determination of Approximate Capacity Factor and Profit 10	4.1.3. Determination of Variable Costs in S/MWh
4.13.3 Relation Volucio Out 5 4.13.4 Allowance Out 6 4.13.5 Present Value of Future Allowance 5 4.13.5 Present Value of Future Allowance 5 4.14 Calculation of Fund Costs of Recofin 15 Devariantion of Algoretainus Capacity Factor and Profit 10	4120 Norible OaM Cost
4.1.3.4. Allowance Cost. 9 4.1.3.5. Present Value of Finite Allowances. 9 4.1.3.5. Descent Value Octor of Ratofits. 10 4.1.5. Descention of Agreentings Capacity Factor and Profit. 10 4.1.5. Descention of Agreentings Capacity Factor and Profit. 10	4.1.3.3. Retrofit Variable O&M Cost. 9
4.1.3.5. Present Value of Future Allowances. 9 4.1.4. Calculation of Future allowances. 10 4.1.5. Desamination of Approximate Capacity Factor and Profit. 10	4.1.3.4. Allowance Cost
4.1.4. Calculation of Fixed Costs of Ratrofits. 10 4.1.5. Determination of Approximate Capacity Factor and Profit. 10	4.1.3.5. Present Value of Future Allowances
4.1.5. Determination of Approximate Capacity Factor and Profit	4.1.4. Calculation of Fixed Costs of Retrofits
4.1.6 Determination of Manning! Cast and Environment	4.1.5. Determination of Approximate Capacity Factor and Profit
4.1.0. Dearministion of Marginal Cost and Emissions	4.1.6. Determination of Marginal Cost and Emissions
4.2. Actions in an Iteration of the Model.	Actions in an Iteration of the Model.
4.2.1. Social of Marginal Cost.	4.2.2. Sorting by biarginal Cost.
4.2.2. String values from the recent meanor	4.2.3. Increment to new units.
5. Data Inputs and Assumptions. 12	Inputs and Assumptions
5.1. Unit Data	Unit Data
5.2. Fuel Price Data	Fuel Price Data
5.2.1. Coal Prices	5.2.1. Coal Prices
3.2.2. Gas Prices	3.2.2. Gas Prices
5.5. Con Type and rig in Con Data	Coal Type and rig in Coal Data
5.5 Canacity Mix Data 13	Canacity Mix Data 13
5.6. Load Share. 13	Load Shape. 13
6. Allowance Allocation	wance Allocation
6.1. Machamisms	Mechanisms 13
6.2. Simulation of Effects	Simulation of Effects
7. Price Elasticity of Demand	Elasticity of Demand
 Types of Kestilts and Sample Outputs. Compliance Out Education in TPLD 6 	



TRUM Inputs: Geographic Extent

 8 IPM Regions encompassing
 "classic" PJM,
 NY, and
 New England





TRUM Inputs: Efficiency, Demand Response, PV, Clean DG

2010	Low	Medium	High
<i>Measures beginning in 2008</i>			
Energy Efficiency (EE)	1% cumulative reduction in load (1,083 MW at peak)	1.5% cumulative reduction in load (1,624 MW at peak)	2.0% cumulative reduction in load (2,166 MW at peak)
Demand Response (DR)	3% reduction at peak hours (3,216 MW at peak)	4% reduction at peak hours (4,266 MW at peak)	5% reduction at peak hours (5,306 MW at peak)
Solar PV, installed capacity	56 MW	112 MW	168 MW
Clean Distributed Generation (DG) in CHP mode, installed capacity	771 MW	1,884 MW	2,975 MW



Level of Modeled Clean Energy by State ¹⁴ (MWh reduced from <u>grid connected</u> EGUs/HEDD)

	STATE	EE(1.5%)	DR(4%)*	PV	CHP*_
	Connecticut	1,497	1,289	-	1,818
	Delaware	1,438	989	8	1,461
	District Of Columbia	116	595	54	250
	Maine	2,682	887	0	2,763
	Maryland	2,181	5,189	92	2,307
	Massachusetts	2,513	2,978	-	3,146
	New Hampshire	407	2,478	-	3,031
	New Jersey	6,394	11,475	184	7,272
	New York	6,180	7,161	405	7,015
	Pennsylvania	6,720	10,405	15	8,598
	Rhode Island	2,244	528	-	2,464
	Vermont	44	92	0	44
₩EP/	Virginia	83	391	40	83

Level of Modeled Clean Energy by State (Tons NOx reduced from <u>grid connected</u> EGUs/HEDD)

STATE	EE(1.5%)	DR(4%)*	PV	CHP*_
Connecticut	1.20	1.68	-	1.38
Delaware	1.25	1.40	0.01	1.29
District Of Columbia	0.10	0.50	0.05	0.21
Maine	0.45	0.34	0.00	0.49
Maryland	4.32	8.41	0.10	4.41
Massachusetts	1.60	2.39	0.00	2.22
New Hampshire	0.49	2.94	-	0.67
New Jersey	6.44	13.48	0.13	6.80
New York	5.85	10.08	0.38	6.50
Pennsylvania	5.35	13.41	0.01	6.01
Rhode Island	0.31	0.15	-	0.39
Vermont	0.06	0.13	0.00	0.06
Virginia	0.06	0.28	0.03	0.06

			NENG	16
	IPI	N Regions	DSNY	
IPM				
Subreg	ion	Territory Description	MACW	
NENG		New England ISO	LILC	
LILC		Long Island	MACE	
NYC		NYC	MACS	
DSNY		Counties: Albany, Dutchess, Essex, Fulton, Gre Rockland, Saratoga, Schoharie, Ulster, Warren	eene, Orange, Rensselaer, , Washington, Westchester	
UPNY		Rest of NY		
MACE		NJ, PA (PECO territory), DE,	and MD	
		(Deimarva Power and Light)		
MACW		PA (excluding PECO & Duqu	esne)	
MACS		NoVA, DC, MD (BG&E & Pep	oco)	

NOx Emission Reduction Estimates (Ib/MWh per HEDD)

Energy Efficiency

DSNY (<i>NY</i>)	2.10
LILC (NY)	3.71
MACE (NJ, DE, <i>PA</i>)	1.87
MACW (PA)	1.53
NENG (CT)	0.87
NYC (<i>NY</i>)	1.67
UPNY (<i>NY</i>)	1.37
MACS (MD, DC, NoVA)	3.85



17



NOx Emission Reduction Estimates (Ib/MWh per HEDD)

Solar PV

OTC Wide = 1.74 lb/MWh per HEDD

> OTC Wide PV installation modeled at 112 MW, not enough to produce subregionspecific figures

OTC Wide = 0.0311 lbs NOx reduced per HEDD per kW installed capacity





NOx Emission Reduction Estimates (Ib/MWh per HEDD)

<u>Clean Combined Heat and</u> <u>Power Applications</u>

(includes affect on grid connected EGUs only. Does not include changes in emissions on-site)

	DSNY (<i>NY</i>)	2.06
	LILC (NY)	3.12
	MACE (NJ, DE, PA)	1.67
	MACW (PA)	1.45
	NENG (CT)	0.79
	NYC (<i>NY</i>)	1.63
	UPNY (<i>NY</i>)	1.38
7	MACS (<i>MD</i> , DC, <i>NoVA</i>)	3.69



Opportunities & Conclusions



Many Places to Look for More Information and Assistance













http://www.epa.gov/cleanenergy/ US EPA, US DOE, ISOs, PUCs, Energy Offices, National and Regional Organizations,



Conclusions

- EE & Clean Energy programs are part of the solution to reduce NOx emissions on HEDDs
 - Meaningful emission reductions
 - Cost effective
 - Established policy mechanisms and technologies
- EPA Guidance allows for inclusion of Clean Energy in SIPs
 Consider TRUM analysis (or other analysis) for estimates of what Clean Energy can achieve, then verify implementation retrospectively
- Continued EPA support to provide tools to ease quantification efforts

